Competing Topological and Kondo Insulator Phases on a Honeycomb Lattice

Xiao-Yong Feng,1,2 Jianhui Dai,1,2,3 Chung-Hou Chung,4,5 and Qimiao Si6

1Condensed Matter Group, Department of Physics, Hangzhou Normal University, Hangzhou 310036, China
2Chen Jian Gong Institute for Advanced Study, Hangzhou Normal University, Hangzhou 310036, China
3Department of Physics, Zhejiang University, Hangzhou 310027, China
4Electrophysics Department, National Chiao-Tung University, HsinChu, Taiwan 300, Republic of China
5National Center for Theoretical Sciences, HsinChu, Taiwan 300, Republic of China
6Department of Physics and Astronomy, Rice University, Houston, Texas 77005, USA

(Received 14 June 2012; revised manuscript received 18 March 2013; published 3 July 2013)

We investigate the competition between the spin-orbit interaction of itinerant electrons and their Kondo coupling with local moments densely distributed on the honeycomb lattice. We find that the model at half-filling displays a quantum phase transition between topological and Kondo insulators at a nonzero Kondo coupling. In the Kondo-screened case, tuning the electron concentration can lead to a new topological insulator phase. The results suggest that the heavy-fermion phase diagram contains a new regime with a competition among topological, Kondo-coherent and magnetic states, and that the regime may be especially relevant to Kondo lattice systems with 5d-conduction electrons. Finally, we discuss the implications of our results in the context of the recent experiments on SmB6 implicating the surface states of a topological insulator, as well as the existing experiments on the phase transitions in SmB6 under pressure and in CeNiSn under chemical pressure.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevLett.111.016402 PACS numbers: 71.10.–w, 71.27.+a, 73.43.Nq, 75.70.Tj

Systems containing both itinerant electrons and local moments continue to attract intensive interest in modern condensed matter physics. The antiferromagnetic exchange coupling between the two components gives rise to the Kondo singlet ground state. Historically, the Kondo effect in a single local-moment impurity provided an understanding of the resistivity minimum in metals as well as the physics of dilute magnetic alloys and quantum nanostructures [1,2]. In the concentrated case, consideration of the Kondo effect and its competition with magnetically ordered ground states has been playing a central role in the understanding of the novel phases and quantum criticality of heavy fermion materials [3]. For the half-filled limit of the Kondo lattice system, the Kondo effect gives rise to the paramagnetic Kondo insulator (KI) state [2,4–6].

Recently, the quantum spin Hall insulator in two dimensions and the topological insulator (TI) more generally have attracted extensive interest [7,8]. These insulators have a charge excitation gap in the bulk, but support gapless surface states protected by time-reversal symmetry. The surface states constitute a helical liquid where the spin orientation is locked with the direction of electron momentum [9,10]. Although they are robust against weak disorders that preserve time-reversal symmetry, the surface states may be influenced by magnetic impurities. For example, the conductance of a one-dimensional edge helical liquid of a two-dimensional TI in the presence of a single magnetic impurity can exhibit a logarithmic behavior at high temperatures and goes to the unitarity limit at $T = 0$ due to the formation of a Kondo singlet [10,11]. This is in contrast to the Kondo problem in conventional Luttinger liquids, where even very weak Coulomb interaction leads to vanishing conductance at zero temperature [12]. Generally speaking, the Kondo screening of magnetic impurities on the surface of TIs may not necessarily be complete due to the $SU(2)$ breaking of the spin-orbit coupling (SOC) [13], and the effective Ruderman-Kittel-Kasuya-Yosida interaction between the local moments can be mediated by the edge carries, leading to an in-plane noncollinear and helical order [14–17]. For magnetic impurities in TIs, previous studies have focused on the effect of surface impurities, i.e., magnetic impurities positioned on the surface of TIs, or coupled effectively to the surface states [18]. Whether and how the bulk magnetic impurities influence the properties of TIs is largely an open problem.

From the perspective of heavy-fermion physics, very interesting properties are emerging from materials that involve 5d electrons, such as the pyrochlore Pr$_2$Ir$_2$O$_7$ [19]. The significant SOC of the 5d electrons may give rise to topologically nontrivial physics for the 5d electrons alone, raising the intriguing question of the interplay between topological and Kondo physics. The regime of transitions among the competing ground states represents a setting in which the effects of strong interactions on TIs may become more tractable. Furthermore, Kondo insulators themselves may become topological as a result of the symmetry properties of the hybridization matrix [20].

Motivated by these recent developments, in this letter we study a dense set of magnetic local moments interacting with the spin-orbit coupled itinerant electrons on the honeycomb lattice as illustrated in Fig. 1. Such a system is
relevant for the graphene or magnetic moment interface and could be constructed through cold atoms in an optical lattice. The system could also be realized by growing a two-dimensional TI on an appropriate magnetic insulating substrate; similar heterostructures involving TI Bi$_2$Se$_3$ thin films and superconducting layers have already been fabricated by the molecular beam epitaxy technique [21]. It may very well be built based on the existing 5$d$-electron-based iridates on the honeycomb lattice, such as Na$_3$IrO$_3$ [22]. Finally, given that recent experiments in SmB$_6$ have provided tentative evidence for the surface states of a topological insulator [23,24], our results here on the transitions between topological insulator and Kondo coherent states lead to the intriguing question of what happens to such surface states when SmB$_6$ and related intermetallic systems are tuned by external or chemical pressure (see below).

The model we consider, illustrated in Fig. 1, is specified by the Hamiltonian

$$
H = -t \sum_{<ij>,\sigma} c_{i\sigma}^\dagger c_{j\sigma} + i\lambda_{so} \sum_{<ij>,\sigma,\sigma'} \nu_{ij} c_{i\sigma}^\dagger \sigma_{\sigma,\sigma'} c_{j\sigma'} + J_K \sum_i \tilde{S}_i \cdot \tilde{S}_i,
$$

where $c_{i\sigma}$ annihilates an electron at site $i$ with spin component $\sigma = \uparrow, \downarrow$, $\tilde{S}_i = c_{i\sigma}^\dagger (\vec{\sigma}_{\sigma,\sigma'}/2) c_{i\sigma'}$, and $\tilde{S}_i$ represents the local moments with $\vec{\sigma}$ being the Pauli matrices. The parameters $t$ and $\lambda_{so}$ are the nearest-neighbor hopping energy and the next-nearest-neighbor intrinsic (Dresselhaus-type) SOC of the conduction electrons, respectively, with $\nu_{ij} = \pm 1$ depending on the direction of hopping between the next-nearest-neighbor sites. Finally, $J_K$ is the antiferromagnetic Kondo coupling between the spins of conduction electrons and local impurities. The model Eq. (1) minimally interpolates the Kane-Mele Hamiltonian ($J_K = 0$) [9,25] and the standard Kondo lattice Hamiltonian ($\lambda_{so} = 0$). We note that recent studies have focused on the effect of Hubbard $U$ interaction of the conduction electrons [26–31].

To proceed, we note that the model of Eq. (1) is connected to the Anderson lattice Hamiltonian,

$$
H = H_{KM} + H_{cd} + H_d,
$$

where $H_{KM}$ is the Kane-Mele Hamiltonian [the first two terms of Eq. (1)], $H_{cd} = \sum_{i} c_{i\sigma}^\dagger d_{i\sigma} + \text{H.c.}$ is the hybridization between the itinerant electrons and localized $d$-electrons, and $H_d = E_0 \sum_{i} d_{i\uparrow}^\dagger d_{i\uparrow} + U \sum_{i} n_{i\uparrow} n_{i\downarrow}$ is for the local electrons with $E_0$ being the local energy level and $U$ the on-site Coulomb repulsion of local electrons. The models described by Eqs. (1) and (2) are equivalent provided that, in the absence of SOC, the $d$-electrons are in the Kondo regime ($U$ is sufficiently large and $E_0$ is well below the Fermi energy ($E_F$) of the conduction band). In this regime, $J_K \sim V^2[(1/E_F - E_0) + (1/U - E_F + E_0)]$. Our calculations will be carried out in Eq. (2). As our focus is on the competition between the TI and KI at half-filling, we shall mainly consider the paramagnetic states.

In the momentum $\mathbf{k}$ space, the conduction electron part of the Hamiltonian takes the form of $H_{KM} = \sum_{\mathbf{k},\sigma} \varepsilon_{\mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{k}\sigma}^\dagger c_{\mathbf{k}\sigma}$, with $C_{\mathbf{k}\sigma} = (c_{a\mathbf{k}\sigma}, c_{b\mathbf{k}\sigma})$ and

$$
M_{\mathbf{k}\sigma} = \begin{pmatrix}
\epsilon_{\mathbf{k}} - \Lambda_{\mathbf{k}} & \mu \\
-\mu & -\epsilon_{\mathbf{k}} - \Lambda_{\mathbf{k}}
\end{pmatrix},
$$

where, $\sigma = +1$ and $-1$ refers to spin up and spin down, $\Lambda_{\mathbf{k}} = 2\lambda_{so} \sin k_1 - \sin k_2 - \sin(k_1 - k_2)$, $\epsilon_{\mathbf{k}} = -t(1 + e^{-i\mathbf{k}} + e^{-i\mathbf{k}})$. We have included the chemical potential $\mu$ term to control the electron filling. The subscripts $a$ and $b$ denote two sublattices of the honeycomb lattice as shown in Fig. 2. Each unit cell has two adjacent $a$, $b$ sites, and the primitive vectors are $\mathbf{a}_1$, $\mathbf{a}_2$.

For the local electrons, we consider the large-$U$ limit and utilize the slave-boson method [1]. The local electrons are expressed as $d_{i\sigma}^\dagger = f_{i\sigma}^\dagger b_{i\sigma}$, with $f_{i\sigma}^\dagger$ and $b_{i\sigma}$ being, respectively, fermionic and bosonic operators satisfying the constraint $b_{i\sigma}^\dagger b_{i\sigma} + \sum_{\sigma'} f_{i\sigma'}^\dagger f_{i\sigma'} = 1$. Introducing the basis $\Psi_{\mathbf{k}\sigma} = (c_{a\mathbf{k}\sigma}, c_{b\mathbf{k}\sigma}, f_{a\mathbf{k}\sigma}, f_{b\mathbf{k}\sigma})$ in the $\mathbf{k}$ space, the mean-field Hamiltonian is expressed as $H_{MF} = \sum_{\mathbf{k},\sigma} \Psi_{\mathbf{k}\sigma}^\dagger H_{\mathbf{k}\sigma} \Psi_{\mathbf{k}\sigma}$ with

$$
H_{\mathbf{k}\sigma} = \begin{pmatrix}
M_{\mathbf{k}\sigma} & r\mathbf{V}I \\
r\mathbf{V}I & (E_0 + \lambda)I
\end{pmatrix}.
$$

Here, $I$ is a $2 \times 2$ identity matrix, $r = \langle b \rangle$ is the condensation density of the bosons, and $\lambda$ is the Lagrange multiplier introduced to implement the constraint. We will carry out our calculations for $N = 2$ ($\sigma = \pm 1$); a large-$N$
generalization in the presence of SOC may also be considered [32]. The quasiparticle bands of the mean-field Hamiltonian Eq. (4) are degenerate for the two spin components. For each spin component, the Hamiltonian can be diagonalized (even though the matrix is $4 \times 4$) giving rise to the quasiparticle dispersion

$$E_k^{(1)} = \frac{1}{2} \left( G_{k+} + \sqrt{G_{k-}^2 + 4r^2V^2} \right) - \mu$$

$$E_k^{(2)} = \frac{1}{2} G_{k-} + \sqrt{G_{k+}^2 + 4r^2V^2} - \mu$$

$$E_k^{(3)} = \frac{1}{2} G_{k+} - \sqrt{G_{k-}^2 + 4r^2V^2} - \mu$$

$$E_k^{(4)} = \frac{1}{2} G_{k-} - \sqrt{G_{k+}^2 + 4r^2V^2} - \mu$$

(5)

with $G_{k\pm} = E_0 + \lambda + \mu \pm \sqrt{\lambda^2_k + |\epsilon_k|^2}$. The parameters $r$ and $\lambda$ are determined by the following equations:

$$\frac{1}{2N} \sum_{k,\sigma,a,b} \langle f_{a,k\sigma} \bar{f}_{a,k\sigma} \rangle + r^2 = 1$$

$$\frac{V}{2N} \sum_{k,\sigma,a,b} \Re \langle f_{a,k\sigma} \bar{f}_{a,k\sigma} \rangle + r\lambda = 0,$$

(6)

(7)

with $N$ being the total number of unit cells and $\Re$ indicating the real part. In the following we shall mainly consider the half-filled case, corresponding to $\mu = 0$.

The formation of the quasiparticle bands, specified by Eq. (5), requires the renormalized hybridization $V^* = rV \neq 0$. By contrast, if $V^* = 0$, the spectra separate into the decoupled conduction bands and local level. Moreover, the band inversion takes place at $V^* = 0$. While this feature is hidden and not important in ordinary Kondo lattice problems, it is crucial in the present problem because now the conduction bands are from the TI. As a consequence, the bulk gap of TI closes at the onset of $V^*$, leading to a quantum phase transition to the KI.

At zero temperature, $r$ (or $V^*$) is nonzero only if $V$ is larger than a critical $V_c$, as a result of the suppressed density of conduction electron states for a honeycomb lattice. Figure 3(a) shows the numerical results for the $V$ dependence of $r$ for several values of $\lambda_\infty$. The local level $E_0$ is taken at the bottom of the conduction band. The critical $V_c \sim 1.3$ for $\lambda_\infty = 0$, and increases almost linearly with $\lambda_\infty$, as seen in the inset of Fig. 3(a). When $V < V_c$, $r = 0$, indicating the Kondo destruction, so the system remains in the TI phase with a bulk gap $\Delta_T = 6\sqrt{3}\lambda_\infty$. While for $V > V_c$, $r \neq 0$, the Kondo screening emerges and the band inversion takes place immediately, so the system enters into the KI phase. For small $r$, the KI phase has a finite hybridization gap $\Delta_K \sim 2r^2V^2/3t$. This is the direct band gap at the $\Gamma$-point where the contribution from the SOC vanishes.

It is interesting to compare the results here for the Kondo-lattice problem with those for its counterpart of a single ion magnetic impurity imbedded in the bulk of the two-dimensional TI. Using the same method, and for $\lambda_\infty = 0.15$ as an example shown in Fig. 3(a), we find $V_c \sim 2.07$ for the single ion Kondo screening which is much larger than $V_c \sim 1.45$ determined here. In the absence of SOC, the finite $V_c$ is due to the fact that the electron host is a pseudogap system so that the single ion Kondo screening needs a nonzero Kondo coupling comparable to the gap amplitude [33–35]. The enhancement of Kondo effect comparing to the single ion Kondo screening is similar to the Kondo lattice with $d$-wave superconducting conduction electrons [36].

We next investigate the surface states of the finite system with boundaries. We take a two-dimensional ribbon by cutting two zig-zag edges with width $N_z$, while the size along $a_1$ remains infinite. Then the boson mean-field $r$ is dependent on the coordinate $n_2$ and the sublattices and can be denoted by $r_n(n_2)$ and $r_b(n_2)$, respectively. We have $r_n(n_2) = r_b(N_2 - n_2)$ due to the inversion symmetry. Figure 3(b) shows the site dependence of $r_n$ and $r_b$ for $N_2 = 40$ and $\lambda_\infty = 0.15$. A general feature is that $r$ decreases rapidly from the edge to the bulk. This feature is attributed to the gapless edge states. $r(n_2)$ is almost flat away from the edges ($5 < n_2 < 35$) as shown in Fig. 3(b), indicating that the finite size effect is relatively small for $N_z = 40$.

Figure 4 shows the energy spectra with four sets of parameters; here, $\mu = 0$ is imposed. Figures 4(a) and 4(b) display the spectra of the conduction electrons in the absence of the Kondo singlet ($V^* = 0$) and for $\lambda_\infty = 0.03$, respectively. The edge states with a single Dirac point at the Fermi energy in Fig. 4(b) manifest the TI phase [9,25]. In comparison, Figs. 4(c) and 4(d) are the spectra for $V > V_c$. The Kondo-singlet formation is clearly reflected in the hybridization gap at half filling and the relatively narrow flat bands near the Fermi energy (near the transition point the flatness is measured by $t/V^*$).

Furthermore, we observe that in the KI phase, the narrow bands can be separated from the continuum by...
We have also calculated the fillings (achieved by tuning the chemical potential respectively, with the gap magnitude and $/C42$.

FIG. 4. The energy spectra for a ribbon of width $N_2 = 40$. (a) $V = 0$ and $\lambda_{so} = 0$; (b) $V = 0$ and $\lambda_{so} = 0.03$; (c) $V = 1.7$ and $\lambda_{so} = 0$; (d) $V = 1.7$ and $\lambda_{so} = 0.03$.

increasing the SOC, leading to a bulk gap at the 1/4 or 3/4 fillings (achieved by tuning the chemical potential $\mu \neq 0$).

This is the direct band gap between $E_k^{(3)}$ and $E_k^{(4)}$ or between $E_k^{(1)}$ and $E_k^{(2)}$ at the points $(2\pi/3, 4\pi/3)$ and $(4\pi/3, 2\pi/3)$, respectively, with the gap magnitude $\Delta_{KT} \sim 6\sqrt{3}\pi^2 V^2\lambda_{so}/\mu^2$ for the large bulk system. Moreover, for the finite system with boundaries, the edge states emerge again with a Dirac point within the bulk gap. This feature is robust for a range of the chemical potential $\mu$ corresponding to the 1/4 or 3/4 filling. We have also calculated the $Z_2$ topological bulk invariant $\Xi_{2D}$ following the monodromy approach developed in Ref. [37]. The result confirms that $\Xi_{2D} = 1$ at half filling and $\Xi_{2D} = -1$ at 1/4 or 3/4 filling. Therefore, the insulating phase at 1/4- or 3/4-filling is topologically nontrivial, and its surface states, while having the spin direction locked by the momentum, contain the contributions from both conduction and local electrons. Hence in the case of Fig. 4(d) we have a new TI phase with the Kondo-singlet formation and a surface heavy-fermion liquid.

We now consider the TI-KI transition around $V_c$. In the present analysis at the saddle-point level, the onset of Kondo effect is continuous [Fig. 3(a)]. Correspondingly, the KI gap sets in continuously. By contrast, on the TI side there is simply a decoupling of the conduction-electron and local-moment components. However, the quantum fluctuations beyond the saddle point reduce the bulk gap from the TI side, as described in some detail in the Supplemental Material [38]. The situation is similar to the case of single-impurity pseudogapped Kondo problem, for which numerical renormalization group calculations, for instance, establish a well-defined second-order phase transition for the Kondo-destruction quantum critical point [39]. In the lattice case, the Ruderman-Kittel-Kasuya-Yosida interaction between the local moments, which is mediated by Kondo coupling in our model, will also induce magnetic order. Taking into account the magnetic order will leave the KI phase intact; as is standard, the Kondo screening present in the KI phase quenches the local moments and their ordering tendency. In the TI phase, we have explicitly shown (in the SM) that an antiferromagnetic order, characterized by the order parameter $M$, will reduce the TI bulk gap to $\Delta_T = 2(3\sqrt{3}\lambda_{so} - J_K M)(1 - V^2/E_0^2)$. This TI gap remains nonzero for a finite range of $M$ and $V$; in other words, the TI phase remains stable in the presence of an antiferromagnetic order for a range of $V < V_c$. Our results can be understood based on general arguments: in the presence of magnetic order, the $Z_2$ topological invariant is replaced by two spin-Chern numbers which remain unchanged when the time reversal symmetry is broken by the magnetic order [40,41]. Meanwhile, the surface states remain gapless unless the bulk gap closes [42,43].

While detailed transitions among KI and TI phases, on the one hand, and antiferromagnetic order on the other is beyond the scope of the present work, our work does reveal that the heavy-fermion phase diagram contains a hitherto unexplored new regime with a competition among topological, Kondo-coherent, and magnetic states; such competition involves the physics of Kondo destruction and associated local quantum criticality [44]. In other words, when the magnetic order and related dynamical effects are incorporated in our analysis, the TI-KI transition discussed here will represent a regime where topological effects strongly interplay with the onset of magnetism and Kondo coherence. The simplification that proximity to quantum criticality brings may very well make the interaction effects on the TI phase and its associated surface states more tractable.

We close by noting that we have treated the hybridization to be k independent. When the spin and k dependences of the hybridization are incorporated, part of the KI phase may itself become topological, as emphasized in Ref. [20].

We now briefly discuss our work in the context of 4f-electron-based Kondo insulators. In SmB$_6$, it is known that a sufficiently large external pressure collapses the Kondo coherence in SmB$_6$ and turns it into an antiferromagnetic metallic state [45]. Combined with the recent experimental evidence in SmB$_6$ for the edge states of a topological insulator [23,24], this is reminiscent of the transition among the topological and Kondo-coherent or magnetic states implicated by the present study. An intriguing question then arises, which deserves the study of future experiments: what happens to the candidate chiral edge states when SmB$_6$ is placed under external pressure? Along a similar line, CeNiSn is another intermetallic system believed to be a Kondo insulator. In CeNiSn, (negative) chemical pressure achieved through Pd or Pt substitution for Ni is known to induce a transition out of its Kondo insulator state [46–49]. It will therefore be informative to explore surface states in the Ce(Pr$_{1-x}$Ni$_x$)Sn and Ce(Pd$_{1-x}$Ni$_x$)Sn series. Finally, it is worth noting that CePtSn has the distinction of involving 5d electrons with a large SOC.

To summarize, we have considered the effect of SOC of the conduction electrons in a Kondo-lattice system. Our
study offers the first qualitative understanding of the competition between topological and Kondo insulator ground states on a simple and yet generic model in two dimensions. While our analysis has so far been primarily confined to the paramagnetic cases, our results already suggest that the overall phase diagram of heavy-fermion systems includes a new regime with competition among topological, Kondo-coherent, and magnetic states. This regime should be particularly prominent for heavy fermion systems whose conduction electron band is associated with the strongly spin-orbit-coupled 5d electrons. As such, our work opens up a new regime of physical interest for compounds based on iridium, platinum, and related 5d elements.

We would like to thank C. Cao, P. Goswami, E. Morosan, A. Nevidomskyy, and Y. Zhou for useful discussions. In particular, we thank S. Paschen for discussions on the Kondo-insulator materials. This work was supported in part by the NSF of China, the NSF of Zhejiang Province, the 973 Project of the MOST, the U.S. Army Research Office under Grant No. W911NF-13-1-0202, and the Robert A. Welch Foundation Grant No. C-1411. C. H. C. acknowledges support by the NSC Grants No. 98-2918-I-009-010-MY3, the NCTU-CTS, the NCTS, and the MOE-ATU program of Taiwan.
